

Planning Commission Work Meeting Minutes

Thursday, July 17, 2014

City Council Chambers

220 East Morris Avenue

Time 6:30 p.m.

Commission Members Present:

Conrad Campos
Jeremy Carter
Holly Carson
Brandon Dalton
Mark Kindred
Rachael Lauritzen
Jonathan Meakin

Staff Members Present:

Michael Florence
Francis Lilly
Hayley Pratt

Due to hearings before the Administrative Law Judge, no Work Meeting was held.

Planning Commission Regular Meeting Minutes

*Thursday, July 17, 2014
City Council Chambers
220 East Morris Avenue
Time 6:30 p.m.*

Commission Members Present: Rachael Lauritzen - Presiding
Conrad Campos
Holly Carson
Rachael Lauritzen
Mark Kindred
Jonathan Meakin

Staff Members Present: Michael Florence
Francis Lilly
Hayley Pratt

Moment of Reflection:

Pledge of Allegiance: Mark Kindred

Motion to Approve the Amended Agenda:

Commissioner Campos

Second the motion: **Commissioner Carter**

Vote: **Unanimous**

New Business

**1. Public Hearing
GP-14-003**

Recommendation to the South Salt Lake City Council to Amend the Future Land Use Map for Property Located at 137 West 3030 South from General Commercial to Medium Density Residential (9-15 units per acre).

City Planner, Hayley Pratt, presented the staff report and stated that the project was discussed at the last Planning Commission Meeting. Currently, there is a vacant home on the property located over one-half mile from the nearest transit stop. The General Plan shows the zoning as Commercial General, however, the adjacency to the transit stops indicates that it could be applicable under the Transit Oriented Overlay District. The lot line adjustment will occur as part of the final plat and the lot will remain in conformance with City ordinance. The neighborhood

in which it is located contains businesses covering a large portion of the block as well as residential uses. Ms. Pratt stated that currently it is a mixed-use neighborhood. The existing zoning is Business Commercial to the overlay and the Future Land Use Map shows it as General Commercial. The proposal is to change the future land use designation to Medium Density Residential, which is 9 to 15 units per acre.

Ms. Pratt described the options available to the Planning Commission as (1) recommend approval, (2) recommend the South Salt Lake City Council amend the Future Land Use Map and designate the .5 acres located at 137 West 3030 South and 115 West 3030 South from General Commercial to Medium Density Residential, 9 to 15 units per acre with the following findings:

1. Given the mixed use nature of the neighborhood, higher density housing can be compatible with the existing uses.
2. Amending the Future Land Use Map would accommodate the higher density housing in appropriate areas and it is close to the transit stop.
3. Amending the Future Land Use Map supports the General Plan's goal of encouraging infill housing by facilitating the redevelopment of abandoned parcels.

The applicant, Dave Curtis, was present on behalf of National Commercial Properties. He reported that they recently completed the townhomes at Huntly Manor. They began with 33 townhomes and completed 35. The last home was recently sold and their office trailer was relocated. They discovered that the subject property has numerous problems and they felt that developing it would improve the area greatly. The townhomes will be 1,650 to 1,700 square feet in size with two-car garages. Mr. Curtis and his associates believe it will be a great addition to the area. Staff agreed. The applicants have met with staff on several occasions and developed a workable plan.

Commissioner Carter stated that when the matter was last discussed he brought up the issue of rooflines. Ms. Pratt stated that the rooflines meet the City's height requirement.

Public Hearing opened at 7:08 p.m.

There were no public comments.

Public Hearing closed at 7:08 p.m.

Chair Lauritzen remarked that the matter was discussed thoroughly at the last meeting and she believed that the amendments address the concerns brought up at that time.

Motion to recommend approval to the City Council.

Commissioner Carson

Second the motion: Commissioner Campos

Vote: Unanimous

**2. Public Hearing
S-14-003**

Recommendation to the South Salt Lake City Council to Amend the South Salt Lake City Zoning Map and Grant Preliminary Plat Approval for a 6-Lot Townhome Planned Unit Development.

Ms. Pratt stated that the request is for preliminary plat approval and a zoning amendment for a six-unit town home project. The applicants have complied with all parking requirements. With respect to open space, one of the concerns pertained to the potential impact on the privacy of the adjacent neighbor to the west. The unit of concern was the southwestern end unit. The backyard of the single-family home lights up with the side façade of the proposed townhomes and the end façade has the potential to infringe on the privacy of the neighbor's backyard. Staff recommended approval subject to specific conditions outlined.

The applicant agreed to remain in compliance with the proposed conditions.

Public Hearing Opened at 7:12 p.m.

There were no further public comments.

Public Hearing Closed at 7:12 p.m.

Motion to approve the request subject to the following conditions:

- 1. The applicant reduces any risk of infringing on the neighboring property to the west of the development through view blocking techniques such as columnar trees planted along the western property line where views into the backyard area from the townhomes are evident. The landscape plan will need to include the tree species that is proposed for the above stated requirement.**
- 2. Maintenance of the landscaped areas including the columnar trees to be planted along the western property line will be performed by the homeowners' association continually and consistently. At no point in time will a lack of view blocking vegetation be permitted along the western parcel line where the neighbors' privacy is at risk.**
- 3. Prior to being issued a building permit the applicant will provide building elevations**

that comply with Townhome-Style Multi-Family Building Design Standards, found in Title 17.12.090 of the South Salt Lake City Municipal Code.

- 4. The applicant will continue to work with City staff to make all technical corrections necessary for recording.**
- 5. The applicant shall work with the City Engineer and Fire Marshal to ensure emergency vehicles have sufficient access to the proposed residences.**
- 6. Bonds for all common and public improvements will be submitted to the City prior to any development.**
- 7. The applicant will work closely with staff to resolve any storm water management concerns that would result from the proposed project.**
- 8. All items of the staff report.**

Commissioner Meakin

Second the motion:

Commissioner Kindred

Vote:

Unanimous

**3. Public Meeting
C-14-033**

Conditional Use Permit for a Warehouse Located in the TOD Overlay Land Use District.

Ms. Pratt presented the staff report and stated that Whitewater Commercial, LLC, is looking to redevelop property at 3137 South 300 West, in the TOD Overlay District, with the underlying zoning being Light Industrial. An existing building on the site will be razed in the location that the new building will be constructed. The surrounding uses are complementary to a warehouse and include professional office, wholesale distribution, professional business services, and construction manufacturing. The required number of parking stalls is 13 with the applicant having provided 18. They also provided bike parking stalls and more landscaping than required. They are proposing 20% landscaping where 10% is required. Five units are proposed. The first two will be occupied by Whitewater Tile. The remaining three will be rented and occupied by other tenants. The first unit also includes a second-story office. The proposed building materials were described as well as the elevations. Staff recommended approval subject to the conditions set forth in the staff report.

In response to a question raised by Commissioner Kindred, Ms. Pratt stated that Whitewater Tile will feature a showroom area, office space, and conference room. The second unit will serve as their warehouse space. At some point the applicant may expand into the other spaces.

The applicant, Paul Washburn, was present representing Whitewater and stated that they began 40 years ago as a manufacturer of cultured marble but the business expanded to bathtubs, solid surface materials for kitchens, cultured stone, and a variety of other products for home decorating. The new building will be fire sprinkled and built to the highest standards possible. They hope to occupy the entire building but they first want to create a presence in the Valley.

In response to a question raised by Commissioner Carter, Mr. Washburn indicated that he does not currently have any potential renters. Manufacturing will not take place on site and will be done at their Lindon plant. He noted that they have another plant in Orem. The proposed building will serve as a showroom and staging area. An air conditioning unit will be placed on the roof and will not be visible from the ground.

Public Hearing Opened at 7:22 p.m.

There were no further public comments.

Public Hearing Closed at 7:22 p.m.

Commissioner Carson commented that any kind of landscaping on 300 West is welcome.

Motion to approve the conditional use permit to construct a warehouse located at 3137 South 300 West subject to the following conditions:

- 1. The applicant is expected to continually meet all parking requirements found in Section 17.27 of the South Salt Lake City Municipal Code.**
- 2. The applicant shall comply with the requirements of the South Salt Lake City Fire Marshal and the South Salt Lake City Engineer prior to constructing the building.**
- 3. The applicant will be required to continually maintain the landscaped areas that are to be included in the project.**
- 4. The applicant shall bond for required site improvements such as the landscaping or other improvements asked to be included and constructed.**
- 5. All other items of the staff report.**

Commissioner Campos

Commissioner Meakin asked if there will be sidewalks on 300 West. Community Development Director, Michael Florence, reported that every new building is required to install sidewalk.

Second the motion:

Commissioner Carter

Vote:

Unanimous

**4. Public Meeting
D-14-003**

Design Review of Proposed New Elevations for the Remaining Lots to be Developed at the Terra Sol PUD.

Deputy Director-Housing Administrator, Francis Lilly, reported that the Granite School District has a skilled trades training program with a long and successful history of purchasing lots in residential subdivisions as they are platted and building them. To that end, they purchased five lots in the Terra Sol Subdivision and are approaching the City to obtain building permits in order to matriculate students to their Skill Trades Program at the Granite Technical Institute and get the remaining five homes built. The homes proposed are similar to ones that already exist, however, as they have reviewed the home plans, they determined that the flat roofs adopted by Terra Sol for their single-story homes don't work for them. The developers are concerned that the roofs won't perform in the long run and have responded responding to warranty issues that have arisen in the Terra Sol Subdivision. They are still using the flat roof model, however, Granite School District's preference was for a shed roof model.

They obtained a variation of the Plan B style that shows a series of shed roofs, which were reviewed. Staff felt that in order to show fidelity to the process where the initial homes were approved and because the design book initially approved for Terra Sol did not contemplate shed roofs or any sort of pitched roof except as an accessory or architectural element on the single-story homes, staff wanted the matter to be presented to the Commission. Mr. Lilly explained that the Design Review Ordinance allows staff to request an application to the Planning Commission for design review. Given that the Planning Commission acted as a land use authority in the initial review, staff thought it would be appropriate for them to act as the land use authority in this case as well. Per the PUD ordinance, what Granite School District is proposing for the remaining homes varies from what the design book specified. The proposed action is being taken out of an abundance of caution and to give the residents of Terra Sol, since they are vested in the community, a chance to understand what the differences will mean for the neighborhood.

Staff's feeling was that the architect has simply made a modification in a manner that is consistent with the remainder of the neighborhood. The Commission, however, was asked to consider the following review standards in making the determination. The ordinance states that in considering a proposed PUD, the Commission should follow the ordinance chapter, the City's development specifications, and any applicable considerations. In any use, the PUD standards

for subdivisions should show that the result of the design is better in terms of livability, appearance, function, and contribution to the City's housing stock while still allowing for alternative housing styles and economic viability of the project than could be achieved by means of regular subdivision standards for the zone in which the project is to be located. Mr. Lilly explained that these are the review standards used for the initial PUD approval and should be used by the Commission in considering the changes to the rooflines.

Mr. Lilly showed the initial designs listed in the design book for the single-family homes. He remarked that the homes themselves haven't changed. Only the roof structure has changed. He noted that two two-story models include a pitched roof with a mono-pitched roof as part of the structure approved in Terra Sol. Although not common, they do exist. Mr. Lilly explained that the applicant is seeking the proposed changes out of concern that the flat roof models have not performed well in this climate and they want to provide a clean product in a home that will work and not require a great deal of warranty work.

While staff finds that the proposed changes are broadly in character with the Terra Sol neighborhood, they feel it requires review by the Commission. The merits of the proposal should be examined to evaluate whether the result in design is compatible with the surrounding designs and contributes to the City's housing stock. If the Commission approves the design review application, staff asked that they require the applicant to submit designs that contribute to the variability and roof lines and articulation that make Terra Sol unique. The different models should be split up and consider alternatives and minor façade changes to ensure that the neighborhood maintains a vibrant character from house to house.

The options presented to the Commission were as follows:

- A. Grant approval of the design review application for the new elevations comprised of Plan B Style 5 and Plan B Style 6 of the Terra Sol PUD. The approval would be granted subject to the following conditions.
 1. The applicant shall submit designs that contribute to the variability of roof lines and articulation that make the Terra Sol neighborhood unique.
 2. All other requirements of the Terra Sol Design Book, approved by the City Council in April 2011, shall remain in effect.
 3. All items of the staff report.

- B. Deny the request based on the finding that the proposed changes are not consistent with the Terra Sol Design Book, approved by the City Council in April 2011.
- C. Continuance.

Commissioner Kindred indicated that Garbett has had numerous problems with the roofs and the proposed change is greatly needed going forward.

In response to a question raised, Mr. Lilly stated that Garbett is reinstalling the stopper scupper systems on each many of the roofs. With regard to elevations as a result of the proposed changes, Mr. Lilly stated that the elevations can be examined. With Style 6, many of the homes have the shed roof feature. In this case it appears that the main roof may be in line or slightly taller than the accessory roof on the side. In the case of the butterfly, there is some height but he was not sure of the exact height to the top of the roof but estimated it to be 16 to 18 feet.

Chair Lauritzen asked if the proposed changes could be carried over to existing buildings. Mr. Lilly stated that presumably they could since a variation would be made to the design book.

Commissioner Kindred reported that Garbett is making the proposed changes uniformly throughout the neighborhood.

The applicant, Curt Davenport, gave his address as 108 East Sweet Berry Drive, in Draper, and stated that he is an instructor and general contractor who has taught a Home Building course for the Granite School District for the past 18 years. The land was originally owned by Granite School District and sold to Garbett Homes with the condition that they set aside five lots for them to build on as they continue their program. The biggest issue was that Granite School District is not a large residential builder. They are simply an educational institution that teaches students how to build homes. As a result, they don't have the resources to come back and work on maintenance issues. The homes they build will be constructed to a very high standard. As they prepared to build in the area, Garbett mentioned to them that they had had issues with the flat roofs in terms of maintenance. Mr. Davenport reported that the plans being submitted are Garbett's plans that they are using in other subdivisions. All else will remain the same including the floor plan and exterior surfaces. Their intent is to blend in and look like all of the other homes with the exception of the roofs.

Commissioner Meakin asked what specifically Garbett is repairing. Mr. Davenport indicated that they have had problems with the drain systems that come off of the parapet walls. Another issue was that going with a flat roof design becomes a liability for the district the students.

Public Hearing Opened at 7:40 p.m.

David Vernon gave his address as 361 Terra Sol Drive and identified important issues. He stated that from the drawing some of the building materials look superficial. He was not opposed, however, to Mr. Davenport using similar design and materials as already exist. Mr. Vernon stated that the drain issue seems to have been taken care of. He felt, however, that the drainage issue will be the more significant issue since it was not considered previously. Mr. Vernon emailed the CEO of Garbett Homes and asked about their efforts to accommodate drainage issues. He stated that water from three homes collected and flowed through a basement window of one of the homes in the neighborhood. Those types of issues were of concern to him and was not considered by Garbett.

Jerry Mellon gave his address as 334 Penney Avenue and stated that they have had an issue with roofing. He explained that the roofing contractor Garbett was using failed to properly seal the seams on the rubber membranes on the roof. As a result, a different roofing contractor will be repairing the roof. He supported the concept of a sloped roof as long as they are not on the two-story models, which would elevate the homes substantially above the others. On the one-story homes, however, he thought it would add diversity, which was what attracted them to the neighborhood.

There were no further public comments.

Public Hearing Closed at 7:45 p.m.

Mr. Lilly stated that in evaluating a new home plan, staff compares it to the existing design standards and checks to ensure that the depth, width, and size of the projections match and are compatible with the existing neighborhood. The existing homes have a particular defined character. Staff will ensure that the accent shed roof in the new home type matches the depth, thickness, width, and color as the other existing roofs.

Chair Lauritzen felt it was a very compatible variation and she liked more variety.

It seemed to Commissioner Carter that the roof systems were poorly constructed and not well thought out. He had a difficult time changing the design pattern in a subdivision based on poor craftsmanship. He understood the concerns of the District but found it difficult to make exceptions based on what he had heard tonight. He commented that the problem is fixable and is being rectified.

Chair Lauritzen indicated that some of the concern about how the flat roofs could be incompatible with the climate, seems to fit with the standards listed by staff earlier. She felt they were a viable option and will involve a different builder. To her, it was a viable option.

Commissioner Dalton remarked that he did not consider it a new design but a variation on the old design. He did not think the character of the neighborhood was defined by flat roofs.

Commissioner Campos liked that they will still hold the developer's feet to the fire and maintain that it will not be out of character or out of proportion. He had no problem with flat roof so long as they are built well.

Commissioner Dalton commented that it was an attempt to address past problems and will be an improvement over what was originally built.

Commissioner Kindred remarked that there already is at least one existing home with a pitched roof.

Commissioner Carson commented that she had never been fond of flat roofs and had no objection.

Motion to grant approval of the design review application for the new elevations (Plan B Style 5 and Plan B Style 6) at the Terra Sol PUD subject to the following conditions:

- 1. The applicant shall submit designs that contribute to the variability of roof lines and articulation that make the Terra Sol neighborhood unique.**
- 2. All other requirements of the Terra Sol Design Book, approved by the City Council in April 2011, shall remain in effect.**
- 3. All items of the staff report.**

Commissioner Campos

Second the motion:

Commissioner Dalton

Vote:

**Conrad Campos - Aye
Jeremy Carter - Nay
Holly Carson - Aye
Brandon Dalton - Aye**

Mark Kindred – Aye
Rachael Lauritzen - Aye
Jonathan Meakin - Aye

The motion passed 6-to-1.

Continuing Business

There was no continuing business.

Commission Business

Approval of the June 19, 2014, Planning Commission Meeting Minutes.

Jeremy Carter and Conrad Campos noted that they need to be listed as present at the June 19, 2014, Regular Meeting.

Motion to approve the meeting minutes from the June 19, 2014, Planning Commission Meeting.

Motion to approve: Commissioner Carson

Second the motion: Commissioner Carter

Vote: Unanimous

Staff Business – Information Items

There was no staff business.

Adjournment

Motion to Adjourn: Commissioner Campos

Second: Commissioner Dalton

Vote: Unanimous

South Salt Lake City Planning Commission Meeting
July 17, 2014

The Planning Commission Meeting adjourned at approximately 7:53 p.m.

For Planning Commission

Michael Florence
Community Development Director